STRATEGIES TO MANAGE THE IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC SECTOR DESIGN & BUILD CONTRACTS IN SRI LANKA

Hewa Dulige Thamasha Kalpani Siriwardana

(179038 J)

Degree of Master of Science in Project Management

Department of Building Economics

University of Moratuwa Sri Lanka

27 October 2023

STRATEGIES TO MANAGE THE IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC SECTOR DESIGN & BUILD CONTRACTS IN SRI LANKA

Hewa Dulige Thamasha Kalpani Siriwardana

(179038 J)

Thesis/Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Master of Science in Project Management

Department of Building Economics

University of Moratuwa Sri Lanka

27 October 2023

DECLARATION

"I declare that this is my own work and this dissertation does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a Degree or Diploma in any other University or institute of higher learning and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where the acknowledgement is made in the text.

Also, I hereby grant to the University of Moratuwa the non-exclusive right to reproduce and distribute my dissertation, in whole or in part in print, electronic or other medium. I retain the right to use this content in whole or part in future works (such as articles or books)."

Signature:

Date:

The above candidate has carried out research for the Masters Dissertation under my supervision.

Name of the supervisor:

Signature of the supervisor:

Date:

ABSTRACT

Strategies to manage the implementation challenges of Public Sector Design & Build contracts in Sri Lanka

"Design and build" is a procurement strategy in which the main contractor is appointed based on the Employer's requirements and as per the principle design by Employer's principle advisor. Contractor needs to perform both design and construction of a particular Construction project. Design & Build procurement method has several advantages, but the standard of service experienced by Employers during the implementation stage of D&B projects has been found to be less than satisfactory. This "Applied research study" investigates the challenges faced by the public sector construction industry in Sri Lanka. when implementing D&B projects; and it also investigate as to how mitigation measures help to face successfully for these challenges.

The preliminary survey conducted to find out various ongoing/recently completed government sector D&B projects and contact details of professionals engaged with those projects to take part as questionnaire respondents. Types of current D&B practices related information also gathered through preliminary survey. Factors affecting for the selection decision of procurement method and various D&B challenges were identified through literature review. Accordingly, the questionnaire survey was developed using the information gathered through preliminary survey and literature review.

Through the study it was found that the 72.5% of procurement decisions were based on purposeful reasons such as need of single point of responsibility, requirement of specialized knowledge, being cost driven projects, need of variety of innovative designs. When considering the satisfaction level of respondents, research found that 67.5% of the employers have successfully identified the real necessity of incorporating D&B method to their projects out of other procurement methods. However, the rest of the respondents, stated that it would have been much more successful under traditional procurement method.

Research found extreme D&B challenges as limited pool of qualified D&B contractors, Project delay, cost overrun, difficulty in tender evaluation and variation valuation. As per expert view those can be mitigated mainly by setting up practical milestones, using change control mechanisms, proper planning, and monitoring, clearly defining the scope etc.

Keywords: Design and Build, Procurement, Challenges, Strategies

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to take this opportunity to thank the many people who support and guided me to complete this research successfully.

I express my heartfelt thanks to my dynamic and inspirational supervisor Chartered Quantity Surveyor Mr. Indunil Seneviratne for all the guidance, support and continuous encouragement provided to me to make this research a successful one. Also, my sincere appreciation to my Viva panel chaired by Chartered QS Prof. Mrs. Kanchana Perera and Chartered QS Mr. Upul Shantha for providing me valuable instructions. Moreover, all the academic staff members of the Department of Building Economics and all the non-academic staff of the Department of Building Economics.

Special thanks go to all the supported professionals at Urban Development Authority, Tech City Development Project, Port City Project, National Water Supply and Drainage Board, Road Development Authority, Department of Buildings, State Development & Construction Corporation, Admin City Development Project, Housing Ministry for the coordination and support provided by giving all required data.

Also, my gratitude goes to Chartered Quantity Surveyor Dilani Abeynayake for the continuous support and guidance extended and Mr. Lasitha Amarasinghe, Eng. Chandanie jayathilake, Eng. Chameera Tharanga and Arch. Madusha Morawaka for the fullest support provided to complete the research successfully.

Finally, I owe a word of appreciation to all my family and friends for their motivation towards me to make this success.

TABLE OF CONTENT

DECLARATION	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	iii
TABLE OF CONTENT	iv
LIST OF FIGURES	i
LIST OF TABLES	i
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	i
CHAPTER 1	1
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Research Problem	3
1.3 Aim & Objectives	4
1.4 Research Methodology	5
1.5 Scope and Limitations	6
1.6 Chapter breakdown	7
CHAPTER 2	8
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.1 Introduction	8
2.2 Procurement in Construction	8
2.2.1 Categories of Construction project procurement systems	10
2.3 Selection of a suitable procurement method	13
2.4 Design & Build Procurement method	15
2.4.1 Evolution of Design & build Procurement method	15
2.4.2 Introduction to Design & Build Procurement method	16
2.4.3 Types of Design & Build method	
2.4 Factors influenced to select D&B procurement strategy	22
2.5 Challenges in Design & build Procurement method	25
2.6 Important factors to success a D&B project	28
2.6.1 Owner experience	
2.6.2 Good quality RFP document	
2.6.3 Flexible RFP document preparation	
2.6.4 Level of design completion	
2.7 Public Sector Construction in Sri Lanka	30

	2.7.1 National Policy on Construction	0
	2.7.2 Issues in the Sri Lankan construction industry	2
	2.7.3 Standard Construction documentation	3
	2.7.4 Design & Build Contracts in the Public sector in Sri Lanka	4
2.8 Co	nceptual framework 3	4
2.9 Su	mmary 3	6
СНАР	TER 3 3	8
3. RES	SEARCH METHODOLOGY 3	8
	3.1. Introduction	8
	3.2. Research Process	8
	3.3. Research approach	1
	3.4. Research Strategy	2
	3.5. Survey strategy	2
	3.6. Data collection	3
	3.6.1. Preliminary survey	3
	3.6.2. Questionnaire survey	3
	3.6.3. Expert survey	7
	3.7. Data analysis	8
	3.8. Summary	0
СНАР	3.8. Summary	
-		1
-	TER 4 5	1 1
-	TER 4 5 FA ANALYSIS 5	1 1 1
-	TER 4 5 FA ANALYSIS 5 4.1 Introduction 5	1 1 1
-	TER 4 5 FA ANALYSIS 5 4.1 Introduction 5 4.2 Preliminary survey findings 5	1 1 1 3
-	TER 45TA ANALYSIS54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information5	1 1 1 3 3
-	TTER 4 5 FA ANALYSIS 5 4.1 Introduction	1 1 1 3 3 3
-	TTER 45 FA ANALYSIS 54.1 Introduction	1 1 1 3 3 3 3
-	TTER 45 FA ANALYSIS 54.1 Introduction	1 1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3
-	TTER 45 FA ANALYSIS 54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3
-	PTER 45 FA ANALYSIS 54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved54.3.5 Respondent Qualifications5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 4
-	TTER 45FA ANALYSIS54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved54.3.5 Respondent Qualifications54.3.6 Interviewee Information of the Expert Survey5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 4 4
-	TTER 45 FA ANALYSIS 54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved54.3.5 Respondent Qualifications54.3.6 Interviewee Information of the Expert Survey54.4 Factors influencing the selection of D&B procurement strategy5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 3 4 4 5
-	TTER 45FA ANALYSIS54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved54.3.5 Respondent Qualifications54.3.6 Interviewee Information of the Expert Survey54.4 Factors influencing the selection of D&B projects54.5 Current practices of Public Sector D&B projects5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 4 4 5 7
-	TER 45FA ANALYSIS54.1 Introduction.54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved54.3.5 Respondent Qualifications54.3.6 Interviewee Information of the Expert Survey54.4 Factors influencing the selection of D&B projects54.5 Current practices of Public Sector D&B projects54.5.1 Use of Principle/Conceptual design for calling bids5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 4 4 5 7 7
-	TER 45 FA ANALYSIS 54.1 Introduction54.2 Preliminary survey findings54.3 Respondent information54.3 Respondent information54.3.1 Response rate of the questionnaire survey54.3.2 Respondent category54.3.3 Organization type54.3.4 Experience and number of D& B projects involved54.3.5 Respondent Qualifications54.3.6 Interviewee Information of the Expert Survey54.4 Factors influencing the selection of D&B projects54.5 Current practices of Public Sector D&B projects54.5.1 Use of Principle/Conceptual design for calling bids54.5.2 Method of evaluating the contractor's proposal5	1 1 1 3 3 3 3 3 3 4 4 5 7 8

4.5.5 The way that D&B contractor performed both design & the construct	tion60
4.5.6 The standard conditions of contract used for D&B projects	60
4.5.7 Method of payment for D&B projects	61
4.5.8 Responsible party for the Public Safety	61
4.6 Challenges in D&B projects	62
4.6.1 Time & Cost related challenges	62
4.6.2 Quality-related Challenges	63
4.6.3 Procurement-related Challenges	64
4.6.4 Contractual challenges	65
4.6.5 External challenges	66
4.6.6 Summary of Data Analysis from Questionnaire Survey	66
4.7 Classification of Identified Challenges	69
4.7.2 Moderate Challenges	70
4.7.3 Extreme Challenges	76
4.7 Summary	85
CHAPTER 5	86
5. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	86
5.1 Introduction	86
5.2 Conclusions	87
5.3 Recommendations	88
5.4 Limitations of the Study	90
REFERENCES	91
APPENDIXES	96
APPENDIX – A QUESTIONNAIRE	96

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2. 1: Hierarchy of procurement options	11
Figure 2. 2: Subcategorizing "working arrangement"	12
Figure 2.3 : D&B Procurement selection factors	15
Figure 2.4 : D&B procurement method: typical organizational structure	17
Figure 2.5: Conceptual Framework	36
Figure 3.1: Research Process	40
Figure 3.2 : Components of research approach	41
Figure 4.1 : Influence factors for D&B selection decision	55
Figure 4.2 : Respondent's satisfaction on D&B selection	56
Figure 4.3 : Principle/Conceptual design used to call for bidding	57
Figure 4.4 : Method of evaluating the Contractor's proposal	57
Figure 4.5 : Method to ensure reasonability of the quoted amount by the D&B contractor	58
Figure 4.6 : Employer's strategy of managing the post contract stage of the D&B project.	59
Figure 4.7 : The way that D&B contractor performed both design & the construction	60
Figure 4.8 : The standard conditions of contract used for D&B projects	60
Figure 4.9 : Method of payment for D&B projects	61
Figure 4.10 : Responsible party for the Public safety	61
Figure 4.11 : RII values of Time & Cost related challenges	62
Figure 4.12 : RII values of Quality related Challenges	63
Figure 4.13 : RII values of Procurement related Challenges	64
Figure 4.14 : RII values of Contractual challenges	65
Figure 4.15 : RII values of External challenges	66
Figure 4.16 RII values of D&B challenges	67
Figure 4.17: impact level of the challenge: "Project delayed than planned"	76
Figure 4.18: Impact level of the challenge: "Exceeding the initial budget"	78
Figure 4.19: Impact level of the challenge: "Difficulties in the valuation of variations"	79
Figure 4.20: Impact level of the challenge: "Difficulty in preparing comprehensive brief"	80
Figure 4.21: Impact level of the challenge: "Difficulty in comparing multiple tenders"	81
Figure 4.22: Impact level of the challenge: "Limited pool of qualified D&B contractors"	82
Figure 4.23: Impact level of the challenge: challenge "A high amount of variations"	83
Figure 4.24: Impact level of the challenge: the challenge "Arising complex disputes"	84

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Analysis of advantages of D&B procurement method in Literature	21
Table 2. 2: D&B procurement selection Criteria	23
Table 2.3: Analysis of challenges of D&B procurement method in Literature	26
Table 2.4: Responsibilities of various construction related Ministries in relation to the National Construction Policy	31
Table 2.5: Identified challenges related to D&B project implementation	37
Table 3.1: How literature review and Preliminary survey findings used to develop questions of the questionnaire survey	39
Table 3.2: Sample population considered for the Questionnaire Survey	44
Table 3.3 Scale used to identify challenges of D&B projects	49
Table 3.4 Legend - Zones of Impact of D&B Challenges	49
Table 4.1: Collected data on recently completed/ongoing government contracts	52
Table 4.2 Organization type of respondents	53
Table 4.3 Details of interviewed experts	54
Table 4.4 Factors influencing to select D&B procurement strategy	54
Table 4.5 RII values of Time & Cost related challenges	62
Table 4.6 RII values of Quality related Challenges	63
Table 4.7 RII values of Procurement related Challenges	64
Table 4.8 RII values of Contractual challenges	65
Table 4.9 RII values of External challenges	66
Table 4.10: Summary of Data from Questionnaire Survey	68
Table 4.11 Barrier Classification and Method to identify control measure	69
Table 4.12 Minor challenges in implementing the D&B procurement method	69
Table 4.13 Moderate challenges in implementing the D&B procurement method	70
Table 4.11 Extreme challenges in implementing the D&B procurement method	76

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Description
AIA	Australian Institute of Architects
BOT	Build, Operate, Transfer
CIDA	Construction Industry Development Authority
CIPS	Chartered Institute of Procurement & Supply
D&B	Design and Build
IPC	Interim Payment Certificate
NACC	National Advisory Council on Construction
NEC	New Engineering Contract
NPA	National Procurement Authority
OBG	Oxford Business Group
QS	Quantity Surveyor
RHP	Request for Proposal
RII	Relative Importance Index
SBD	Standard Bidding Document
SL	Sri Lanka